# UNIVERSITAT POLITÈCNICA DE CATALUNYA 

Master on Numerical Methods in Engineering

## HOMEWORK 1

Course: Programming for Engineers and Scientists
Name: Yonatan Lisne Luque Apaza

## 1. Introduction

This report accompanies the finite element solver, developed in matlab, for the Poisson equation in two dimensions under a domain of [01] x[01] with an obstacle. The solver can resolve other domains by varying the GetBoundary.m function.

The general characteristics of the program are shown in addition to the convergence analysis for the homework meshes.

## 2. Finite Element for Poisson Equation in 2D

### 2.1.Poisson Equation

The nomenclature of the variables is the same in the program. The governing equation is given by:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\boldsymbol{\nabla} .(D \nabla \phi)+Q=0 \quad \text { in } \Omega \\
\phi-\bar{\phi}=0 \quad \text { on } \Gamma_{d} \\
\boldsymbol{n} \cdot \boldsymbol{q}=q_{n}+\alpha\left(\phi-\phi_{q}\right) \text { on } \Gamma_{n} \\
\boldsymbol{q}=-D \boldsymbol{\nabla} \phi
\end{gathered}
$$

### 2.2.Weak form

$\int_{\Omega}(\nabla w) \cdot(D \nabla \phi) d \Omega+\int_{\Gamma_{n}} w \alpha \phi d \Gamma=\int_{\Omega} w Q d \Omega-\int_{\Gamma_{n}} w\left(q_{n}-\alpha \phi_{q}\right) d \Gamma+\int_{\Gamma_{d}}(w D \nabla \phi) \cdot \boldsymbol{n} d \Gamma$
For Galerkin formulation:

$$
\begin{array}{cc}
w=N_{i} & \nabla w=\nabla N_{i} \\
\phi=\sum_{j}^{n} N_{j} \phi_{j}=N_{j} \phi_{j} & \nabla \phi=\sum_{j}^{n}\left(\nabla N_{j}\right) \phi_{j}=\left(\nabla N_{j}\right) \phi_{j}
\end{array}
$$

Is obtained:

$$
\int_{\Omega}\left(\nabla N_{i}\right) \cdot\left(D\left(\nabla N_{j}\right) \phi_{j}\right) d \Omega+\int_{\Gamma_{n}} N_{i} \alpha N_{j} \phi_{j} d \Gamma=\int_{\Omega} N_{i} Q d \Omega-\int_{\Gamma_{n}} N_{i}\left(q_{n}-\alpha \phi_{q}\right) d \Gamma+r_{\Gamma_{d}}
$$

For each element:

$$
\begin{aligned}
K_{i j}^{(e)} & =\int_{\Omega^{(e)}} D\left(\nabla N_{i}^{(e)}\right) \cdot\left(\nabla N_{j}^{(e)}\right) d \Omega+\int_{\Gamma_{n}^{(e)}} \alpha N_{i}^{(e)} N_{j}^{(e)} d \Gamma \\
f_{i}^{(e)} & =\int_{\Omega^{(e)}} N_{i}^{(e)} Q d \Omega-\int_{\Gamma_{n}^{(e)}} N_{i}^{(e)}\left(q_{n}-\alpha \phi_{q}\right) d \Gamma+r_{\Gamma_{d}}^{(e)}
\end{aligned}
$$

### 2.3.Matrix form

Considering:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}=\left[\begin{array}{llll}
N_{1}^{(e)} & N_{2}^{(e)} & \ldots & N_{n e}^{(e)}
\end{array}\right] \\
\boldsymbol{X}^{(e)}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}
x_{1}^{(e)} & y_{1}^{(e)} \\
x_{2}^{(e)} & y_{2}^{(e)} \\
\vdots & \vdots \\
x_{n e}^{(e)} & y_{n e}^{(e)}
\end{array}\right]
\end{gathered}
$$

Is obtained:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& {\left[\begin{array}{ll}
x & y
\end{array}\right]^{(e)}=\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)} \boldsymbol{X}^{(e)} } \phi^{(e)}=\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)} \boldsymbol{\phi}^{(e)} \\
& \boldsymbol{B}^{(e)}=\boldsymbol{\nabla} \boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}=\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
\frac{d N_{1}^{(e)}}{d x} & \frac{d N_{2}^{(e)}}{d x} & \ldots & \frac{d N_{n e}^{(e)}}{d x} \\
\frac{d N_{1}^{(e)}}{d y} & \frac{d N_{2}^{(e)}}{d y} & \ldots & \frac{d N_{n e}^{(e)}}{d y}
\end{array}\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

Introducing local coordinates:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\boldsymbol{B}_{\xi \eta}^{(e)} & =\boldsymbol{\nabla}_{\xi \eta} \boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}
\end{aligned}=\left[\begin{array}{llll}
\frac{\partial N_{1}^{(e)}}{\partial \xi} & \frac{\partial N_{2}^{(e)}}{\partial \xi} & \ldots & \frac{\partial N_{n e}^{(e)}}{\partial \xi} \\
\frac{\partial N_{1}^{(e)}}{\partial \eta} & \frac{\partial N_{2}^{(e)}}{\partial \eta} & \ldots & \frac{\partial N_{n e}^{(e)}}{\partial \eta}
\end{array}\right]
$$

The Jacobian matrix for two and one dimension:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \boldsymbol{J}^{(e)}=\left[\begin{array}{ll}
\frac{\partial x}{\partial \xi} & \frac{\partial y}{\partial \xi} \\
\frac{\partial x}{\partial \eta} & \frac{\partial y}{\partial \eta}
\end{array}\right]=\boldsymbol{B}_{\xi \eta}^{(e)} \boldsymbol{X}^{(e)} \\
& \boldsymbol{J}_{1 D}^{(e)}=\left[\begin{array}{ll}
\frac{\partial x}{\partial \xi} & \frac{\partial y}{\partial \xi}
\end{array}\right]=\boldsymbol{B}_{\xi}^{(e)} \boldsymbol{X}^{(e)}
\end{aligned}
$$

Is obtained:

$$
\boldsymbol{B}^{(e)}=\left(\boldsymbol{J}^{(e)}\right)^{-\mathbf{1}} \boldsymbol{B}_{\xi \eta}^{(e)}
$$

The matrix and vector in interior and boundary:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\boldsymbol{K}^{(e)}=\boldsymbol{K}_{\Omega}^{(e)}+\boldsymbol{K}_{\Gamma_{n}}^{(e)} \\
\boldsymbol{f}^{(e)}=\boldsymbol{f}_{\Omega}^{(e)}+\boldsymbol{f}_{\Gamma_{n}}^{(e)}+\boldsymbol{r}_{\Gamma_{d}}^{(e)}
\end{gathered}
$$

Matrix form and quadrature integration with $z_{g}$ point and $w_{g}$ weights of each element:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\boldsymbol{K}_{\Omega}^{(e)}=\int_{\Omega_{\xi \eta}^{(e)}} D\left(\boldsymbol{B}^{(e)}\right)^{\boldsymbol{T}}\left(\boldsymbol{B}^{(e)}\right)\left|\boldsymbol{J}^{(e)}\right| d \Omega_{\xi \eta}=\sum_{g=1}^{n_{g}} w_{g} D_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\left(\boldsymbol{B}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right)^{\boldsymbol{T}}\left(\boldsymbol{B}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right)\left|\boldsymbol{J}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right| \\
\boldsymbol{K}_{\Gamma_{n}}^{(e)}=\int_{\Gamma_{\Gamma_{\xi}}(e)} \alpha\left(\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}\right)^{\boldsymbol{T}}\left(\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}\right)\left|\boldsymbol{J}_{1 D}^{(e)}\right| d \xi=\sum_{g=1}^{n_{g}} w_{g} \alpha_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\left(\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right)^{\boldsymbol{T}}\left(\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right)\left|\boldsymbol{J}_{1 D}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right| \\
\boldsymbol{f}_{\Omega}^{(e)}=\int_{\Omega_{\xi \eta}^{(e)}}\left(\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}\right)^{\boldsymbol{T}} Q\left|\boldsymbol{J}^{(e)}\right| d \Omega_{\xi \eta}=\sum_{g=1}^{n_{g}} w_{g}\left(\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right)^{\boldsymbol{T}} Q_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\left|\boldsymbol{J}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right| \\
\boldsymbol{f}_{\Gamma_{n}}^{(e)}=-\int_{\Gamma_{n}}\left({ }_{\xi}^{(e)}\left(\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}\right)^{\boldsymbol{T}}\left(q_{n}-\alpha \phi_{q}\right)\left|\boldsymbol{J}_{1 D}^{(e)}\right| d \xi=\sum_{g=1}^{n_{g}} w_{g}\left(\boldsymbol{N}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right)^{\boldsymbol{T}}\left(q_{n_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}}-\alpha_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)} \phi_{\left.q_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right)}\right)\left|\boldsymbol{J}_{1 D}^{(e)}{ }_{\left(\mathbf{z}_{g}\right)}\right|\right.
\end{gathered}
$$

Obtain vector $\boldsymbol{r}_{\Gamma_{d}}^{(e)}$ is not necessary. Because we will eliminate the equations where $\phi_{j}$ value are previously established, and replace this value in the rest of equations.

Finally $\boldsymbol{\nabla} \phi$ values are obtained as an average of the adjoining elements in each node.

$$
(\boldsymbol{\nabla} \phi)^{(e)}=\left[\begin{array}{l}
\frac{d \phi}{d x} \\
\frac{d \phi}{d x}
\end{array}\right]^{(e)}=\boldsymbol{B}^{(e)} \boldsymbol{\phi}^{(e)}=\left(\boldsymbol{J}^{(e)}\right)^{-1} \boldsymbol{B}_{\xi \eta}^{(e)} \boldsymbol{\phi}^{(e)}
$$

## 3. Matlab Solver

The program can be started in MainSolver.m where you will be asked to enter the names of the files containing the nodes and elements, and then ask if you want to set different conditions to the preset parameters, which match the homework:

$$
\left\{\begin{aligned}
\Delta u & =0 & & \text { in } \Omega, \\
\nabla u \cdot \mathbf{n} & =-1 & & \text { on } \Gamma_{\text {in }}=0 \times(0,1), \\
\nabla u \cdot \mathbf{n} & =1 & & \text { on } \Gamma_{\text {out }}=1 \times(0,1), \\
\nabla u \cdot \mathbf{n} & =0 & & \text { on } \partial \Omega \backslash\left(\Gamma_{\text {in }} \cup \Gamma_{\text {out }}\right), \\
u(0,0) & =0 & &
\end{aligned}\right.
$$

If you select the parameters by default, the program will start SolverDefault.m, Which has a similar procedure if other parameters are established. The results will be generated with the name Solution.vtk.

The HWsolver.m function solve all the meshes of the homework.

### 3.1.Standard solution process

All solutions follow the standard process Shown in Figure 1. It starts with reading the files containing the mesh, and then you get the boundary elements with the GetBoundary.m.

After obtaining all the information of the mesh and selecting the appropriate reference element, the global matrix is assembled with the FEM_System.m function.

Then, the Neumann conditions for each of the boundary of this type are applied through the SetNeumanBoundary.m function.

The last condition to apply is the Dirichlet type with the SetDirichletBoundary.m function.
Finally the linear system is solved and the solution is exported with ToParaview.m function.


Figure 1: Standard solution process schema

### 3.2.Main functions

### 3.2.1. FEM_System

In this function we obtain the values of the global assembly of all the $\boldsymbol{K}_{\Omega}^{(e)}$ matrices and $\boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{\Omega}}^{(e)}$ vectors, according to the matrix form presented.

| FEM_System.m |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| K K | Global Matrix of K |
| $\boldsymbol{\kappa} \mathrm{f}$ | Global Vector of f |
| $y \mathrm{X}$ | Nodal coordinates |
| $\searrow \mathrm{T}$ | Connectivities |
| \ referenceElement | Reference element for 2D |
| $\searrow \mathrm{D}$ | D parameter (function of ' $x$ ' and ' $y$ ') |
| $\searrow \mathrm{Q}$ | Q parameter (function of ' $x$ ' and ' $y$ ') |

```
K = zeros(nPt,nPt);
f = zeros(nPt,1);
for i=1:nElem
    Te=T(i,:);
    Xe=X(Te,:);
    Ke=zeros(nen,nen)
    fe=zeros (nen,1);
    for j=1:nOfGauss
        N_j=N(j,:);
        Nxi_j=Nxi (j,:);
        Neta_j=Neta(j,:);
        w_j=wgp(j);
        xg=N_j*Xe(:,1);
        yg=N_j*Xe(:,2);
        J_j=[Nxi_j ; Neta_j]*Xe;
        B_j=J_j\[Nxi_j ; Neta_j]
        Ke=Ke+B j'*B j*D(xg,yg)*w j*det(J j);
        fe=fe+N_j'*Q(xg,yg)*W_j*det(J_j);
    end
    K}(\textrm{Te},\textrm{Te})=\textrm{K}(\textrm{Te},\textrm{Te})+\textrm{Ke}
    f(Te)=f(Te) +fe;
```

Figure 2: FEM_System.m code

### 3.2.2. SetNeumannBoundary

This function adds $\boldsymbol{K}_{\Gamma_{n}}^{(e)}$ and $\boldsymbol{f}_{\Gamma_{n}}^{(e)}$ values of all the elements to the global assembly, according to the matrix form presented.

| SetNeumannBoundary.m |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{array}{ll} \boldsymbol{K} & \mathrm{K} \\ \boldsymbol{\kappa} & \mathrm{f} \end{array}$ | Global Matrix of K Global Vector of $f$ |
| 】 K | Global Matrix of K |
| $\searrow \mathrm{f}$ | Global Vector of f |
| $\pm \mathrm{X}$ | Nodal coordinates |
| $\geq \mathrm{E}$ | Conectivities [nBound n1' n2' .. ne'] |
| $\searrow$ nBoundary | Numero of boundary to set |
| $\searrow$ referenceElement | Reference element for 1D |
| $\searrow \mathrm{qn}$ | qn parameter (function of 'x' and ' $y$ ') |
| $\searrow$ alpha | alpha parameter (function of 'x' and ' y ') |
| $\pm$ Phiq | Phiq parameter (function of ' $x$ ' and ' $y$ ') |

```
for i=1:nElem
    BDe=E(i,1);
    if BDe==nBoundary
        Ee=E (i, 2: end);
        Xe=X (Ee,:);
        Ke=zeros (nen, nen) ;
        fe=zeros (nen,1)
        for j=1:nOfGauss
            N_j=N(j,:);
            Nxi_j=Nxi(j,:);
            w_j=wgp(j);
            xg=N_j*Xe(:,1);
            vg=N j*Xe(:,2)
            J1D=Nxi_j*Xe;
            Ke=Ke+N j'*N j*alpha(xg,yg)*norm(J1D)*W j;
            fe=fe-N_j'*(qn(xg,yg) -alpha (xg,yg)*Phiq(xg,yg))*norm(J1D)*W_j;
        end
        K}(\textrm{Ee},\textrm{Ee})=\textrm{K}(\textrm{Ee},\textrm{Ee})+\textrm{Ke}
        f(Ee)=f(Ee)+fe;
    end
nd
```

Figure 3: SetNeumannBoundary.m code

### 3.2.3. SetDirichletBoundary

This function reduces the size of the matrix and global vector at the preset $\boldsymbol{\phi}$ values and replaces these values in the rest of equations.

## SetDirichletBoundary.m

| $\boldsymbol{\kappa}$ Kd | Global Matrix of K with Dirchlet cond. |
| :---: | :---: |
| $\boldsymbol{K}$ fd | Global Vector of $f$ with Dirchlet cond. |
| $\kappa \mathrm{Nd}$ | Nodes with Dirchlet cond. |
| $\boldsymbol{\kappa}$ Nnd | Nodes without Dirchlet cond. |
| $\kappa$ Pd | Phi values in nodes Nd |
| У K | Global Matrix of K |
| $\geqslant \mathrm{f}$ | Global Vector of $f$ |
|  | Numero of boundary to set |
| $\geqslant \mathrm{Pd}$ | Phi value (function of 'x' and ' $y$ ') |

Table 3: Input and Output of function

```
nNd=size(Nd);
nPt=size(K,1);
Ndd=[];
Pdd=[];
aux1=0;
aux2=0;
auxp=0;
for i=1:nNd
    aux1=Nd(i);
    auxp=Pd(i);
    for j=(i+1):nNd;
        if Nd(j)<aux1
            aux1=Nd(j);
            auxp=Pd(j);
        end
    end
    if not(aux1==aux2)
        Ndd=[Ndd; aux1];
        Pdd=[Pdd; auxp];
    end
    aux2=aux1;
end
Nd=Ndd;
Pd=Pdd;
Nnd=[1:nPt]';
Nnd (Nd) = [] ;
Kd=K (Nnd, Nnd) ;
fd=f (Nnd) -K (Nnd,Nd) *Pd;
```

Figure 4: SetDirichletBoundary.m code

## 4. Homework Meshes Solution

### 4.1.Solution

The solution of the meshes was made with HWsolver.m function. This function starts SolverDefault.m function for each of the homework meshes.

The SolverDefault.m function has preset the parameters of the homework, which are:

The domain parameters:

```
D='1';
Q=10';
```

The boundaries $\mathrm{y}=0, \mathrm{y}=1$ and obstacle as Neumann type with parameters:

```
qn='0';
alpha='0';
Phiq='0';
```

The boundaries $x=0$ as Neumann type with parameters:

```
qn='1';
alpha='0';
Phiq='0';
```

The boundaries $x=1$ as Neumann type with parameters:

```
qn='-1';
alpha='0';
Phiq='0';
```

Default the reference point is $\boldsymbol{\phi}_{(\mathbf{0}, \mathbf{0})}=\mathbf{0}$.
The solver displays a report like the one in Figure 5 where:
$t 1(s)$ : Time needed to read the input.
$t 2(s)$ : Time to get boundary.
$t 3(s)$ : Time to assemble the global system.
$t 4(s)$ : Time for apply boundary conditions.
$t 5(s)$ : Time used to solve lineal system.
$t 6(s)$ : Time used to write solution.
$\operatorname{Phi}(1,1)$ : Phi value in $(1,1)$.

| SOLVER HOMEWORK REPORT |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \#item | \#mesh | \#Elements | \#Nodes | \#N/elm | t1 (3) | t2 (3) | t3(3) | t4 (3) | t5 (3) | t6 (3) | ttotal(s) | Phi (1,1) |
| 1 | 1 | 458 | 1008 | 6 | 0.00955 | 0.67965 | 0.58015 | 1.41376 | 0.05988 | 0.09489 | 2.83788 | 1.33656626 |
| 2 | 2 | 889 | 1909 | 6 | 0.01457 | 2.38175 | 1.07591 | 2.69720 | 0.11663 | 0.15577 | 6.44184 | 1.33659650 |
| 3 | 3 | 2300 | 4816 | , | 0.03557 | 15.87867 | 2.75304 | 6.96673 | 0.77000 | 0.50829 | 26.91229 | 1.33660730 |
| 4 | 4 | 5136 | 10600 | 6 | 0.10736 | 108.76248 | 7.63991 | 19.73461 | 6.29833 | 1.11226 | 143.65496 | 1.33660953 |
| 5 | 5 | 9134 | 18708 | 6 | 0.19697 | 346.17642 | 13.61909 | 36.28275 | 27.89456 | 1.96559 | 426.13539 | 1.33661021 |
| 6 | 1 | 458 | 275 |  | 0.00484 | 0.28929 | 0.34394 | 0.07937 | 0.02175 | 0.04069 | 0.77987 | 1.32890204 |
| 7 | 2 | 889 | 510 | 3 | 0.00710 | 1.03690 | 0.66766 | 0.11305 | 0.05038 | 0.08880 | 1.96390 | 1.33237269 |
| 8 | 3 | 2300 | 1258 | 3 | 0.01665 | 6.43522 | 1.73181 | 0.19750 | 0.12539 | 0.17849 | 8.68506 | 1.33478303 |
| 9 | 4 | 5136 | 2732 | 3 | 0.03619 | 31.43363 | 3.82937 | 0.31005 | 0.40301 | 0.39148 | 36.40372 | 1.33572333 |
| 10 | 5 | 9134 | 4787 | 3 | 0.06395 | 98.49190 | 6.93708 | 0.50257 | 1.14946 | 0.68197 | 107.82694 | 1.33607291 |
| 11 | 1 | 246 | 838 | 8 | 0.00940 | 0.46034 | 0.55849 | 1.22115 | 0.03600 | 0.08789 | 2.37326 | 1.33658354 |
| 12 | 2 | 428 | 1416 | 8 | 0.01442 | 1.37724 | 0.94576 | 2.12644 | 0.07257 | 0.14506 | 4.68150 | 1.33660345 |
| 13 | 3 | 1161 | 3699 | 8 | 0.03677 | 9.97005 | 2.57422 | 5.81167 | 0.47061 | 0.37175 | 19.23507 | 1.33660956 |
| 14 | 4 | 2678 | 8362 | 8 | 0.08170 | 53.05696 | 5.95125 | 13.58826 | 3.26771 | 0.84318 | 76.78906 | 1.33661031 |
| 15 | 5 | 4606 | 14258 | 8 | 0.14175 | 155.36810 | 10.21332 | 23.72107 | 13.22618 | 1.43817 | 204.10857 | 1.33661047 |
| 16 | 1 | 246 | 296 | 4 | 0.00469 | 0.17356 | 0.24648 | 0.08600 | 0.01572 | 0.03635 | 0.56280 | 1.33239211 |
| 17 | 2 | 428 | 494 | 4 | 0.00643 | 0.47487 | 0.42617 | 0.11307 | 0.02779 | 0.05806 | 1.10640 | 1.33407543 |
| 18 | 3 | 1161 | 1269 | 4 | 0.01477 | 3.17050 | 1.15081 | 0.18986 | 0.08765 | 0.14853 | 4.76212 | 1.33565000 |
| 19 | 4 | 2678 | 2842 | 4 | 0.03229 | 15.59365 | 2.67022 | 0.35360 | 0.30455 | 0.33207 | 19.28639 | 1.33621090 |
| 20 | 5 | 4606 | 4826 | 4 | 0.05456 | 45.45209 | 4.62106 | 0.53627 | 0.97981 | 0.56589 | 52.20968 | 1.33635960 |
| END SOLVER HOMEWORK |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Figure 5: Solver homework report
Solution files can be found in the same location as the meshes, Solution.vtk, Which we can postprocess with Paraview software. Reports are also saved in the same folder named report.txt.

Figure 6 shows a post processing by Paraview with the scalar variables Phi, pres (pres =-velo.velo / 2 ) and velo vector variable.


Figure 6: Post-processing with Paraview of PES_2D_quad_quad/mesh5.

### 4.2.Time solution

The times shown in the report, figure 5, are plotted by type of elements and are shown in figure 7.

The tendency of behavior of processing time with respect to the amount of nodes can be approximated according to Table 4.

The greater time difference can be observed for 44 which corresponds to the time of application of the boundary conditions, the trend shows more time for the second order elements.


Figure 7: processing time by number of nodes.

| Element type | t1 |  | t2 |  | t3 |  | t4 |  | t5 |  | t6 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\approx C . n \wedge A$ |  | $\approx C . n \wedge A$ |  | $\approx C . n \wedge A$ |  | $\approx C . n^{\wedge} A$ |  | $\approx C . n \wedge A$ |  | $\approx C . n^{\wedge} A$ |  |
|  | C | A | C | A | C | A | C | A | C | A | C | A |
| Tri6 | 4.87E-06 | 1.07 | 2.27E-07 | 2.14 | $2.82 \mathrm{E}-04$ | 1.10 | 5.76E-04 | 1.12 | 1.19E-08 | 2.17 | 6.39E-05 | 1.05 |
| Tri3 | 2.14E-05 | 0.94 | $3.03 \mathrm{E}-06$ | 2.04 | $1.03 \mathrm{E}-03$ | 1.04 | $1.82 \mathrm{E}-03$ | 0.67 | $1.11 \mathrm{E}-05$ | 1.34 | 1.54E-04 | 0.99 |
| Quad8 | 1.07E-05 | 0.99 | $4.07 \mathrm{E}-07$ | 2.07 | 5.27E-04 | 1.04 | $9.60 \mathrm{E}-04$ | 1.06 | $2.31 \mathrm{E}-08$ | 2.10 | $9.41 \mathrm{E}-05$ | 1.01 |
| Quad4 | 4.28E-05 | 0.84 | 1.97E-06 | 2.00 | 6.73E-04 | 1.05 | $2.64 \mathrm{E}-03$ | 0.61 | 4.58E-06 | 1.42 | $1.26 \mathrm{E}-04$ | 0.99 |

Table 4: Trend of processing time behavior.

### 4.3.Error of solution

Taken as the reference solution, the mesh 5 of the elements quad8 can estimate the relative error by comparing the $\boldsymbol{\phi}_{(\mathbf{1 , 1 )}}$ values. The behavior of this error with respect to the number of nodes can be observed in figure 8 and table 5 .

The fall of the error in the elements type Quad8 is much faster than the rest of elements followed by Tri6.


Figure 8: Relative error by number of nodes.

| error |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Element type | $\approx$ C.nA |  |
|  | C | A |
| Tri6 | 4.53 | -1.71 |
| Tri3 | 1.07 | -0.93 |
| Quad8 | 52.46 | -2.21 |
| Quad4 | 1.07 | -1.02 |
| Table 5. Error behavior |  |  |

Table 5: Error behavior.

